



CITY OF FORT LAUDERDALE
RFP EVALUATION COMMITTEE TABULATION

RFP# 575-11928
 TITLE: Group DHMO and DPPO Dental Plan Benefits
 DATE: 4/11/2017

Rater #1 - Matthew Cobb													
PROPOSING FIRM	Size, accessibility, adequacy and quality of networks in Broward, Dade, P.Beach and Monroe Counties with minimal displacement of existing network providers; national DHMO and DPPO			The level of benefits for the DHMO plan; the satisfaction level of existing employer clients, members and network providers; the ability to provide the requested experience and			The level of benefits for the indemnity DPPO plan; the satisfaction level of existing employer clients, members and network providers; the ability to provide the requested			Total premium cost including rate guarantees and renewal caps			
	Weight Factor	Ranking	Point Subtotal	Weight Factor	Ranking	Point Subtotal	Weight Factor	Ranking	Point Subtotal	Weight Factor	Ranking	Point Subtotal	Total Points Awarded
Aetna	0.3	2	0.60	0.2	2	0.40	0.2	2	0.40	0.3	2	0.60	2.00
Cigna	0.3	1	0.30	0.2	1	0.20	0.2	1	0.20	0.3	1	0.30	1.00

Rater #2 - Melissa Ferrer													
PROPOSING FIRM	Size, accessibility, adequacy and quality of networks in Broward, Dade, P.Beach and Monroe Counties with minimal displacement of existing network providers; national DHMO and DPPO network for			The level of benefits for the DHMO plan; the satisfaction level of existing employer clients, members and network providers; the ability to provide the requested experience and utilization data			The level of benefits for the indemnity DPPO plan; the satisfaction level of existing employer clients, members and network providers; the ability to provide the requested experience and			Total premium cost including rate guarantees and renewal caps			
	Weight Factor	Ranking	Point Subtotal	Weight Factor	Ranking	Point Subtotal	Weight Factor	Ranking	Point Subtotal	Weight Factor	Ranking	Point Subtotal	Total Points Awarded
Aetna	0.3	2	0.60	0.2	2	0.40	0.2	2	0.40	0.3	2	0.60	2.00
Cigna	0.3	1	0.30	0.2	1	0.20	0.2	1	0.20	0.3	1	0.30	1.00

Rater #3 - Steve Simac															
PROPOSING FIRM	Size, accessibility, adequacy and quality of networks in Broward, Dade, P.Beach and Monroe Counties with minimal displacement of existing network providers; national DHMO and DPPO			The level of benefits for the DHMO plan; the satisfaction level of existing employer clients, members and network providers; the ability to provide the requested experience and			The level of benefits for the indemnity DPPO plan; the satisfaction level of existing employer clients, members and network providers; the ability to provide the requested			Total premium cost including rate guarantees and renewal caps					
	Weight Factor	Ranking	Point Subtotal	Weight Factor	Ranking	Point Subtotal	Weight Factor	Ranking	Point Subtotal	Weight Factor	Ranking	Point Subtotal	Total Points Awarded	Total Combined Points Awarded	Final Ranking
Aetna	0.3	2	0.60	0.2	2	0.40	0.2	2	0.40	0.3	2	0.60	2.00	6.00	2
Cigna	0.3	1	0.30	0.2	1	0.20	0.2	1	0.20	0.3	1	0.30	1.00	3.00	1