
**WOOD FRAME VERNACULAR
RESIDENCES OF COCONUT GROVE
VILLAGE WEST
MULTIPLE PROPERTY DESIGNATION**



Historic and Environmental Preservation Board



City of Miami

REPORT OF THE CITY OF MIAMI PRESERVATION OFFICER,
WARREN ADAMS,
TO THE HISTORIC AND ENVIRONMENTAL PRESERVATION BOARD
ON THE FINAL DESIGNATION OF
WOOD FRAME VERNACULAR RESIDENCES
IN COCONUT GROVE VILLAGE WEST
AS A MULTIPLE PROPERTY DESIGNATION

Amendment:

Designation report amended to remove properties where appeals were granted by City Commission on October 11, 2018.

Prepared By: Vickie Toranzo
Historic Preservation Planner

Warren Adams
Preservation Officer

Reviewed By: Wendy Sczechowicz
Historic Preservation Officer

Submitted June 18, 2018

Amended: July 16, 2018

Passed and Adopted: July 16, 2018

Resolution No.: HEPB-R-18-050

Appeals: October 11, 2018

Resolution No's.: R-18-0452 – R-18-0465



Warren Adams
Preservation Officer

Contents

I.	General Information.....	3
II.	Statement of Significance.....	4
III.	Description.....	15
IV.	Application of Criteria for Designation.....	18
V.	Planning Context.....	19
VI.	Bibliography.....	20
VII.	Photographs.....	23
VIII.	List of Properties.....	24

I- General Information

Historic Names: Kebo, West Coconut Grove, West Grove, Village West

Architectural Period of Significance: 1911-1941

Location: Coconut Grove

Present Owner: Multiple Owners

Present use: Residential

Zoning: Various

Folio No.: See attached list.

Boundary:

Percival Avenue to the north, Mac Donald Street and Main Highway to the east, Jefferson Street to the west, and Marler Avenue to the south.

II- Statement of Significance

Coconut Grove Village West is one of the longest continuous communities within the City of Miami. Many of its residents are descendants of the area's Bahamian pioneering families and Southern African Americans, both of which came to Miami in search of employment opportunities. Working as domestics, laborers, chauffeurs, farm workers, tour guides, construction workers, and more, they served as the backbone in the development of Coconut Grove, the greater Miami area, and Coral Gables. They resided in the wood frame vernacular residences that are part of this designation. As such, these buildings are significant as they are associated with a community that has existed for 140 years.

In his publication, *Black Immigrants: 'Bahamians in early twentieth-century Miami'*, historian Raymond A. Mohl states, "Unlike the rest of the British West Indies, plantation agriculture was never very successful or profitable in the Bahamas. Only about two per cent of the total Bahamian land area of about 4,000 square miles was considered suitable for crops. Most nineteenth-century Bahamians earned a livelihood from the sea or from subsistence agriculture. By the 1830s, black and white Bahamians were beginning to migrate to the Florida Keys, especially Key West, where they worked in fishing, sponging, and turtling. The distance was short, and jobs in Florida paid cash wages. Facing meager economic prospects at home, free Bahamian blacks found better employment opportunities in Key West."¹

One of the earliest Afro-Bahamians to come to Miami was Mariah Brown. Born in Eleuthera, Bahamas, she migrated to Key West during the 1880s. Sometime between 1885 and 1890 she relocated to Coconut Grove where she was hired by Charles Peacock to work at the Peacock Inn.² According to Miami historian Dr. Paul George, she informed her husband, Ernest, of the job opportunities available. Shortly thereafter, he ventured to Coconut Grove. Seeking employment opportunities, other Bahamians followed.³

Mariah Brown and the other Bahamian settlers purchased parcels of land from homesteader Joseph Frow for \$50 a parcel. Within walking distance of the Peacock Inn, a settlement known as Kebo was established along what is known today as Charles Avenue.⁴ According to Miami historian Arva Parks Moore, Kirk Munroe named the

¹ Mohl, R.A. (2009). *Black immigrants: Bahamians in the early twentieth-century Miami*. *Tequesta*, volume 1, (number 69). Retrieved from <http://dpanther.diu.edu/dpService/dpPurlService/purl/FI18050900/00069>, p.8.

² Day, J.S. & Eaton, S.E. (1995). Report of the City of Miami Preservation Officer to the Historic and Environmental Preservation Board on the designation of the Mariah Brown House as a Historic Site. Miami, FL: City of Miami Planning Department, p.5.

³ Miccosukee Magazine. (2002) Episode 352. History of Coconut Grove by Dr. Paul George. Retrieved from <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=gIDPEYpA4UQ>

⁴ Day, J.S. & Eaton, S.E., p. 5.

developing community Kebo.⁵ The name Kebo was derived from the highest peak of Mt. Kilimanjaro.⁶ Parks Moore further explains, members of the Kebo community would have daytime baptisms in front of the Barnacle. Further, she argues, despite segregation, the founding pioneers of the white and black communities had a close relationship.⁷

Another pioneer who contributed to the development of the community was Ebenezer Woodbury Franklin Stirrup (E.W.F. Stirrup). The pioneer migrated to South Florida in 1888, and moved to Coconut Grove in 1899, where he constructed his family home and upwards of 100 small wooden framed houses, which he made available for purchase to the newly arriving Afro-Bahamians. Some of these structures remain and are included as part of this designation.⁸

Unlike Mariah Brown and E.W.F. Stirrup, Alice Burrows inherited the land on which her house was built. Little is known about the pioneer, except that she was a laundress and a close friend of Mary Burr Munroe, who upon her death bequeathed a parcel of land on which Burrows had been residing. According to an article in the Miami News, Munroe's will stated that if her husband, Kirk Munroe, did not survive her, Burrows was to inherit half of her estate.⁹

The arrival of Bahamians was crucial to the development of Coconut Grove, Coral Gables, and Miami. George E. Merrick, founder of the City of Coral Gables, former President of the Historical Association of Southern Florida, and one of the founders of the University of Miami wrote in 1941: "Through the 70's, 80's, and right through the 1890's, they were practically the only available workers, the Georgia Negroes did not come in any volume until after 1900, after the coming of the railroad. In this West Indian period all of our heavy laborers were Bahaman Negroes. I believe these Bahaman Negroes had a most distinct and important influence, in that they brought inspiration to many of the first English, French, Northern and Southern planters; to all of those early settlers who at first were skeptical of the coral-rocky country, forbidding and desolate from the planting standpoint. In the Bahamas there is the same coral rock; and the Bahaman Negroes knew how to plant on it; and how to use it: and they knew too that all kinds of tropical trees would grow and thrive on this rock. They, too, had a vital influence upon our civilization in bringing in their own commonly used trees, vegetables and fruits. Soon these supplemented all those that had been brought in by the Bahaman whites – the sea-living Conchs. Such things were introduced as the pigeon pea, soursop, star-apple, sugar-apple, Jamaica apples, and all the anons – caneps, sapotes, and dillies. These fruits can

⁵ Parks Moore, A. (2010). Mary Barr Munroe, 1852-1922: South Florida's pioneer zealot. In L.E. Rivers & C. Brown Jr. (Eds.), *The varieties of women's experiences: Portraits of southern women in the post-civil war century*. Gainesville, FL: University Press of Florida.

⁶ Miccosukee Magazine.

⁷ Parks, Arva Moore. (2010). Coconut Grove (Images of America). Charleston SC: Arcadia, p. 31.

⁸ Eaton, S.E and Uguccioni, E. J. (2004). Report of the City of Miami Preservation Officer to the Historic and Environmental Preservation Board on the Designation of the E.W.F. Stirrup House as a Historic Site. Miami, FL: City of Miami.

⁹ Unknown. (1922, November). Relatives are well remembered in will Mrs. Mary C. Munroe. *The Miami News*, p.14.

still be found in best profusion in the Bahaman colored village in Coconut Grove (which was first called Monrovia, and which was the first Bahaman Negro settlement on the Bay) and also in their villages at old Lemon City, Cutler, and Perrine. These Negroes had built their homes in their own island of the coral-rock, and they brought here their skill in masonry building. Today, some of the oldest buildings in Coconut Grove and old Cutler are of the same construction which has been in use for one hundred and fifty years in the Bahamas. Built without cement with only the native lime mortar, these houses have withstood the countless hurricanes of the Bahamas! This knowledge of building with the native coral limestone came with Bahaman Negroes, as did so much other valuable knowledge and experience in the building of walls, roads, other uses of the coral; and uses of the land, and of the sea."¹⁰

In her autobiography, native and longtime resident of Coconut Grove Village West, Thelma Gibson states, "Much of the vegetation was planted by the hands of the Colored men who brought so much of it from the Bahamas. The palm and coconut trees were natural. The flowers, such as the hibiscus, bougainvillea, crotons and roses, were prolific in the Bahamas."¹¹

Another Bahamian valuable contribution to South Florida was architecture in the form of wood frame vernacular homes. The function of the homes was to give shelter as all activities were conducted outdoors which allowed for close interaction within the community; Esther Mae Armbrister said: "When people were married once upon a time, they would march. One woman lived on William Avenue and she marched in her wedding gown from her house all the way around Hibiscus with her wedding party. They used to walk in the streets from their house to the church or wherever it was they were going to get married. They walked the streets with someone holding their gown. You would look out the window and see the whole wedding party go by. One time two sisters got married – they lived down on Charles Avenue – and they walked from across the street to their house and got married on the front porch. The street was blocked off. Then they had a party, and all the food you would want."

This behavior can be explained by the cultural tradition inherited by their ancestral West Africans; Denise Andrews says in her essay (The Bahamian Influence on the South Florida Shotgun House): "The history of African people suggests that members of a community were families, or clans – a single lineage. The communities basically were composed of one head of household and the extended family members of the household – which could be hundreds of people. Compounds were created so that families could live

¹⁰ Merrick, G.E., (1941). Pre-Flagler influences on the lower Florida east coast. *Tequesta*, volume one, (number one). p.5.

¹¹ Gibson, T. A. (2000). *Forbearance: The life story of Thelma Vernell Anderson Gibson, a Coconut Grove Native*. Homestead, FL: Helena Enterprises, Incorporated. p 35.

together communally. Traditionally there was no concept of privacy or single mindedness as we know today. Family and family life was central, intimate and communal."¹²

As the community known as Kebo expanded, Southern African Americans migrated to the area in search of employment. According to Dr. Marvin Dunn, there was friction between the newly arriving African Americans from Georgia and the Bahamian community.¹³ In the film *The Black Miami*, Arva Parks Moore, local Miami native historian, explains that while they shared a common history in slavery, the Bahamians and African Americans from the South didn't relate because slavery had been abolished earlier in the Bahamas¹⁴, which abolished slavery in 1834¹⁵, while the United States abolished slavery 30 years later in 1865.

When discussing what she refers to as the Southern Migration, Dr. Joanne Hyppolite, former chief curator of HistoryMiami and current curator at the National Museum of African American History Culture, explained that, just like the Bahamians, African Americans from Alabama and Georgia came to Miami in search of employment. They worked building streets, on people's homes, the railroad, and on farmland.¹⁶ Despite their initial friction, the Southern African Americans lived and married within the settlement that had established itself along Evangelist Street, which today is known as Charles Avenue.

"Citing that it was too difficult to bring in supplies or truck their crops over the existing footpath they asked for a road. When the request was denied, they gathered loose coral-rock, loaded their wagons one moonlit night and dumped the rock where they thought the road should be."¹⁷ Evangelist Street was officially born, and soon the little village would thrive.

"Town officials relented and soon the road was extended to where Hibiscus Street intersects today. Charles Avenue is narrow and out of line, especially when viewed from its entrance on Main Highway, because it was laid out by homesteaders and not surveyors."¹⁸

Soon Charles Avenue became the spine of the community, Esther Mae Armbrister, remembered as interviewed by William Labbee in 1991: "Back then they called Charles Avenue by the name Evangelist Street, until they named it in the late Twenties after an early settler called Charles Frow. But this street was it. It was the main drag. It was the hopping place to be, William Avenue to the north was a back street, nothing but a cow

¹² Andrews, D. (n.d.) The Bahamian influence on the South Florida shotgun house. Retrieved from <http://www.kislakfoundation.org/millennium-exhibit/andrews1.htm>

¹³ Williams, M. (Producer & Director), & Smith, C. (Producer & Director). (2014). *The Black Miami*. [Motion picture]. United States: Sundicado.

¹⁴ *Ibid.*

¹⁵ The National Archives. (n.d.). Abolition of slavery. Retrieved from <http://www.nationalarchives.gov.uk/slavery/about.htm>

¹⁶ Williams, M. & Smith, C.

¹⁷ Cave, Donald H. "Grove's Charles Avenue." *Miami News*. January 5, 1971, Sec. A. 16.

¹⁸ *Ibid.*

path for years and years. Both Charles and Franklin, the next one over to the south, were rocky, rocky, rocky, nothing but crushed rock – they used to call Franklin Rocky Road, when I came here; they had eventually gotten 'round to tarring them."¹⁹

She further recalled, "All the business, everything was right here on Charles Avenue. Old Man Joe Major had a bicycle shop. Old Man Stirrup had a grocery store. There was a soda shop and ice cream parlor. And then they had a Cleaner's, belonged to Old Man Summons. He died last year; I didn't even know it. Father Culmer had a pressing club – a cleaner's – before he was a priest. He also was an organist at Christ Episcopal Church. After he got married and moved to Overtown and he became a priest at St. Agnes."²⁰

Evangelist Street received its name due to the multiple churches that were established along its path. Formerly known as, St. Agnes Baptist Church, the Macedonia Missionary Baptist Church is the oldest congregation in South Florida. It was founded in 1895 after 56 members left the Union Chapel. In 1895 Jean D' Hedouville gave the members of the Fifty-Six Baptist Church a tract of land on Margaret Street to build their church, named St. Agnes. In 1903 the church relocated to Charles Avenue. In 1948, the congregation moved to its current location at 3515 Douglas Road.²¹

Christ Episcopal Church was founded by the Bahamian settlers of Coconut Grove on March 24, 1901²². The original church building was constructed on the corner of Hibiscus Street and William Avenue. In 1910 the neighboring lot was bought and the church was moved to its current location²³. The original church building was converted into a Sunday school building. In 1911, St. Alban's Industrial School moved from Key West to the building that housed the Sunday school. The school held classes for the children of the new Bahamian community. St. Alban's provided an education nine months of the year in "...academia, music, Bible study, as well as training in the trades, such as home economics, needlework, and furniture repair."²⁴ The current church, located at 3481 Hibiscus Street, was designated by the City of Miami as a Historic Site in 2011.

On April 27, 1896, Reverend Jeremiah H. Butler, along with approximately twelve other members, whom had withdrawn their membership from St. Agnes Church due to cultural differences, founded Greater St. Paul A.M.E. Church. Members of the church included Pastor Butler, Brothers J.P. Brookins and Walter Burrows, Murray Burrows, J.W. Gibson, William Counts Blackshear, James W. Williams, and Theodore McCloud. According to their website, the same year the church established what would become known as the

¹⁹ Labbee, W. (1991). Black Grove feature. *Miami New Times*. Retrieved from <http://www.miaminewtimes.com/1991-07-31/news/black-grove-feature/full>

²⁰ *Ibid.*

²¹ Macedonia Missionary Baptist Church, Inc. (2015). About Us. Retrieved from <http://www.macedoniambcmiami.com/about-the-church>

²² Christ Episcopal Church. "Who We Are". (2017). Retrieved from http://chrepch.org/?page_id=24

²³ *Ibid.*

²⁴ *Ibid.*

first black school, Dade County Training School.²⁵ In 2011 it served 3,000 community residents. When the Church was founded in 1896, it served 300 community residents.²⁶

Founded in 1916 by Afro-Bahamian settlers, St. James Baptist Church of Coconut Gove was established during the peak of the Ku Klux Klan era. Originally called Second Baptist Church, but was changed to St. James Missionary Baptist Church by Reverend Samuel Higgs. The brick building they constructed in 1926 was destroyed by the hurricane that devastated Miami, but they would not be defeated and began construction of a new building next year. In 1935, the church was partially destroyed by another hurricane, but just as before, the parishioners overcame.²⁷

The multiplicity of churches indicates the role they played in the community. In an interview with Roshan Nebhrajani, Coconut Grove native Thelma Gibson states, "Most of my activities also surrounded around the church, because most people were involved with the church. We went to Sunday school activities."²⁸ "Back in the day, the church is where the majority of blacks went to find solace in a time of turmoil and injustice. It was a place where neighbors met for fellowship and social gatherings; a place for Sunday afternoon picnics and potluck dinners; where friendships were made and nurtured for years."²⁹

Today, descendants of the pioneering families continue to have reunions. In 2016, a reunion was held in Miami. The family names for those in attendance included Barry, Bethel, Cash, Cleare, Curry, Fisher, Grant, Higgs, Johnson, Major, Roberts, Saunders, Sawyer, Stirrup, Sweeting, and Walker. According to the Miami Herald, there were upwards of 90 cousins in attendance. They traveled from Harbour Island, New York, New Jersey, Pennsylvania and Maryland, Tampa, Jacksonville, and Orlando to be part of the momentous event.³⁰ These gatherings are a testament to the connectivity of the pioneer families that are associated with the wood frame vernacular structures within Coconut Grove Village West.

²⁵ Greater St. Paul A.M.E. (2007). GPS Church history.

Retrieved from http://www.greaterstpaulame.com/church_2_003.htm

²⁶ Del Reigon, E. (2011, April 11). Greater Saint Paul AME celebrates 115 years of service. *Miami Herald*.

Retrieved from <http://www.miamiherald.com/news/local/community/miami-dade/coconut-grove/article1937968.html>

²⁷ Hines, B. L. (2015, December 21). Neighbors in religion: Coconut Grove church readies for 100th anniversary celebration. *Miami Herald*.

Retrieved from <http://www.miamiherald.com/news/local/community/miami-dade/community-voices/article50943305.html>

²⁸ Nebhrajani, R. (2016, May 22.) Thelma Gibson looks back on 90 in West Grove. *The New Tropic*. Retrieved from <https://thenewtropic.com/thelma-gibson/>

²⁹ Hines, B. L. (2015, December 21). Neighbors in religion: Coconut Grove church readies for 100th anniversary celebration. *Miami Herald*.

Retrieved from <http://www.miamiherald.com/news/local/community/miami-dade/community-voices/article50943305.html>

³⁰ Jenkins Fields, D. (2016, August 11). Descendants of families from Liberia hold Miami reunions. *Miami Herald*.

Retrieved from. <http://www.miamiherald.com/news/local/community/miami-dade/community-voices/article95123427.html>

Using city directories and census data, the Preservation Office has identified that the residents, whether renters or owners, were of Bahamian and Southern African American origins and decent. While the criteria for designation of the wood frame vernacular residences does not include their association with someone significant in the past, it is important to point out how their residents contributed to the establishment of the community and their contributions not only to the local community, but the greater Miami area.

Pictures:

3242 Charles Ave



Located on historic Charles Avenue, this two-story wood frame home was the residence of Ebenezer Woodbury Franklin Stirrup, his wife Charlotte Jane, their children, and multiple generations thereafter. Stirrup migrated to South Florida in 1888, and moved to Coconut Grove in 1899, where he constructed his family home and upwards of 100 houses for the newly arriving Bahamians. A self-made millionaire, Stirrup died in 1957 at the age of 84.³¹

³¹Eaton, S.E. and Uguccione, E. J. (2004). Report of the City of Miami Preservation Officer to the Historic and Environmental Preservation Board on the Designation of the E.W.F. Stirrup House as a Historic Site. Miami, FL: City of Miami Planning Department

3250 Charles Ave



This was the home of Alice and Walter Burrows. Upon her death, Mary Burr Munroe bequeathed the parcel of land on which Burrows had been residing. According to an article in the Miami News, Munroe's will stated that if her husband, Kirk Munroe, did not survive her, Burrows was to inherit half of her estate.³²

³² Unknown.

3587 Hibiscus Street



This home was built by the Sturup family. One resident was Verneka Sturup Silva who was “the first African American in Miami to receive a Masters in Social Work, the first African American to become a principle at Coral Gables Senior High, the first African American to chair the Metro Dade Community Relation Board, and the first African American woman to serve the Diocese of Southeast Florida Standing Committee. She was also the first Black female to be appointed Assistant Principal for Secondary Administration in the Dade County Public School System.”³³

The designation of this property was appealed. The appeal was granted by City Commission on October 11, 2018. This property is not historically designated and not subject to review.

³³ AT&T Miami-Dade County African-American History Calendar 2005/2006. (2005). Sturup, Verneka Silva. Retrieved from <http://www.theblackarchives.org/archon/index.php?p=digitallibrary/digitalcontent&id=206>

3517 Hibiscus Street



During the 1920s, William and Estelle Counts, founders of St. Paul AME Church, built their family home. The home continues to be owned by the Counts family.

III- Description

Frame Vernacular, as defined by the City of Miami Preservation Office Historic Design Guidelines, refers to a simple wood frame building, which is the product of the builder's construction experience, available resources at the time, and the surrounding environment. These structures are typically rectangular, of balloon frame construction, and rest on piers. They are one or two stories in height, with one-story front porches, and gabled or hipped roofs with overhanging eaves. Horizontal weatherboard and drop siding are the most common exterior wall materials although there are also examples of stucco exterior walls. Some early buildings feature vertical board and batten siding or wood shingles, while asbestos shingles are common to post-1930s construction. Wood double-hung sash windows are typical. Ornamentation is sparse, but may include shingles, corner boards, porch columns, brackets, rafter tails, vents in the gable ends, and oolitic limestone detailing.

A Shotgun House is a style of Wood Frame Vernacular Residence with particular design characteristics. Shotguns are narrow rectangular one-story wood frame structures with a front porch. Built on piers, they have gabled or hipped roofs and horizontal weatherboard or drop siding. The front façade normally contains a doorway on one side and a window on the other. Wood double-hung sash windows are typical and ornamentation consists of decorative woodwork on doors, porches, and under the eaves³⁴. Most are freestanding structures; however, there are examples of two Shotguns joined together at the rear. Internally, they are typically one room wide with the rooms placed back to back. These narrow structures can be accommodated on a small lot or a half-lot.

The origin of Shotgun Houses has been much debated. Some scholars note similar forms in the West Indies and trace them to early Haitian influences in New Orleans where they became popular with freed slaves migrating to the south after the Civil War. Others believe they are the one-room-deep, hall-and-parlor plan of the South turned sideways to fit on narrow urban lots³⁵. The Shotgun drew its name from its long rectangular shape as supposedly a shotgun blast could travel through the building without hitting a wall.

The buildings included in the Multiple Property Designation are all wood frame structures that contain the above elements to varying degrees. Some also include features not mentioned above such as a chimney or dormer windows.

³⁴ Weaver, P. L. (n.d.) *Model guidelines for design review: A guide for developing standards for historic rehabilitation in Florida communities*. Tallahassee, FL: State of Florida.

³⁵ McAlester, V. S. & McAlester, L. (2002). *A field guide to American houses*. New York, NY: Knopf.

All of the structures surveyed for inclusion in the Multiple Property Designation have been altered to some extent. These alterations range from minor works that do not significantly affect the integrity or character of the structure to more extensive works which may have some impact on a structure's character. Some examples of minor exterior alterations include reroofing, the replacement of doors and windows, the replacement of damaged siding with siding of a differing profile, the infilling of foundations, the removal or addition of ornamentation, and the installation of shutters and awnings. Properties that have been subjected to minor alterations have been included in the Multiple Property Designation as the structures still retain their historic character, design details, and much of their integrity.

One common alteration undertaken to a number of the properties surveyed is the enclosure of the front porch. While this has some impact on the appearance of the structures, this has been a common practice for many years and, when undertaken correctly, this is an appropriate alteration which, in some cases, are historically and culturally significant elements of the structures. The appropriate method of enclosing the front porch is to use wood siding which is both historically accurate and compatible with the Frame Vernacular style. Structures that have enclosed porches undertaken in this way have been included in the Multiple Property Designation. There are examples of structures where the front porch has been enclosed using brick or block. These materials are historically inaccurate and, when added to the front elevation, they are incompatible with the Frame Vernacular style. Structures that have been altered in this way have been excluded from the Multiple Property Designation.

Several of the structures surveyed have been altered by the construction of an addition. Appropriate additions (with the exception of added front porches) are to the rear of the historic structure and do not significantly impact the historic structure. Additions may be constructed of concrete block and stucco as they are to the rear and this differentiates the original structure from the addition. Structures with appropriate additions that meet these criteria have been included in the Multiple Property Designation while those with additions that do not meet these criteria have been excluded.

A small number of structures surveyed have been altered by the replacement of the wood siding or stucco with an inappropriate material such as brick. These alterations negatively impact the structures through the removal of a character-defining feature of the Frame Vernacular style. Structures that have undergone this type of alteration have been excluded from the Multiple Property Designation.

In addition to retaining historical, architectural, and cultural significance and meeting the criteria for designation as described in Section IV of this report, the structures included in the Multiple Property Designation must retain some degree of integrity of location, design,

setting, materials, workmanship, feeling, and association. To possess integrity, each property must retain several of these aspects.

The subject properties retain a high level of integrity with regard to location and setting as they remain on their original sites within residential areas. The structures also retain high levels of integrity with regard to design, materials, and workmanship as, although some alterations have been taken place, this work has been undertaken sensitively using appropriate materials and methods and therefore has not significantly impacted the design.

Feeling is a property's expression of the historic sense of a particular period of time resulting from the presence of physical features that, taken together, convey the property's historic character. As the properties retain integrity of setting, design, materials, and workmanship, they convey the feeling of residential life in the Coconut Grove Village West community in the early twentieth century.

The properties also retain a high level of integrity with regard to association as all are associated with the establishment and continued settlement and development of Coconut Grove Village West by Bahamians, African-Americans from the South, and their descendants.

IV- Application of Criteria for Designation

The “Wood Frame Vernacular Residences of Coconut Grove Village West Multiple Property Designation” is eligible to be designated as a multiple property designation by the City of Miami for having significance in the historical, cultural, aesthetic, and architectural heritage of the city, and possessing integrity of design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling, and association; and for meeting the following criteria:

3. Exemplify the historical, cultural, political, economic, or social trends of the community;

The Wood Frame Vernacular Residences of Coconut Grove Village West Multiple Property Designation exemplify the historical, cultural, and social trends of the community. The community that these buildings are associated with was established 140 years ago and continues today. They contributed to the development of Coconut Grove, Miami, and Coral Gables. The community's Bahamian and Southern American roots influenced the style of architecture and construction. And finally, the design of the residences impacted the way they socialized.

4. Portray the environment in an era of history characterized by one or more distinctive architectural styles;

Coconut Grove Village West contained wood frame vernacular residences that were influenced by the Bahamas and the Southern United States. Historically, this style of architecture was found within other Bahamian and Southern African American neighborhoods including Lemon City and Overtown.

5. Embody those distinguishing characteristics of an architectural style, or period, or method of construction;

The Wood Frame Vernacular Residences of Coconut Grove Village West Multiple Property Designation reflects the architectural trends within Coconut Grove Village West during the period between 1910s and 1940s. They retain sufficient integrity to convey their historic character and construction.

V- Planning Context

Setting

The subject properties are located within the Coconut Grove Village West portion of Coconut Grove. The boundaries are Percival Avenue to the north, Mac Donald Street and Main Highway to the east, Jefferson Street to the west, and Marler Avenue to the south.

The area is part of the Neighborhood Conservation District – 2 (NCD-2) and the Coconut Grove NET Office. With the exception of a few properties, the residences are one story with front porches. The residences are single family homes and duplexes. Some parcels contain two, three, or four structures.

Incentives

Historic district designation will ensure that the neighborhood retains original Bahamian architecture. Design review of new construction that may be built on the parcels will assist in maintaining the aesthetic harmony. Further, for owners of single-family residences as well as income producing properties there is an ad valorem tax incentive for improvements in both Miami and Miami-Dade County. The Preservation Fund, established by the Arts in Public Places program, will provide grants to low income households in order to ensure maintenance of the structures. Designation also provides zoning and building relief which is intended to preserve the buildings. There are current plans to expand the Omni Community Redevelopment Authority in Coconut Grove to create affordable housing. These funds would offer financial assistance.

VI- Bibliography

Andrews, D. (n.d.) The Bahamian Influence on the South Florida shotgun house.
Retrieved from <http://www.kislakfoundation.org/millennium-exhibit/andrews1.htm>

AT&T Miami-Dade County African-American History Calendar 2005/2006. (2005). Sturup, Verneka Silva.
Retrieved from <http://www.theblackarchives.org/archon/index.php?p=digitallibrary/digitalcontent&id=206>

Christ Episcopal Church. (2017) Who We Are.
Retrieved from http://chrepch.org/?page_id=24

City of Miami, Florida. Tax Cards 5-55-1661. MacFarlane Homestead.

City of Miami, Florida. Tax Cards 5-56-1691. MacFarlane Homestead.

City of Miami, Florida. Tax Cards 5-56-1750. Frow Homestead Amended.

City of Miami, Florida. Tax Cards 5-56-1751. St Albans Park.

City of Miami, Florida. Tax Cards 5-56-1891. Frow Homestead.

City of Miami, Florida. Tax Cards 5-56-2111. Frow Homestead.

City of Miami, Florida. Tax Cards 5-56-2389. Frow Homestead.

City of Miami, Florida. Tax Cards 5-56-2469. Frow Homestead.

City of Miami, Florida. Tax Cards 5-56-2501. Frow Homestead

City of Miami, Florida. Tax Cards 5-56-2531. Frow Homestead.

City of Miami, Florida. Tax Cards 5-56-2549. Frow Homestead.

City of Miami, Florida. Tax Cards 5-56-2585. Frow Homestead.

City of Miami, Florida. Tax Cards 5-56-2621. Frow Homestead.

City of Miami, Florida. Tax Cards 5-56-2721. Frow Homestead.

City of Miami, Florida. Tax Cards 5-56-2851. De Hedouilles Subdivision.

Dunn, Marvin. Black Miami in the Twentieth Century. University Press of Florida. 1997.

Gibson, Thelma Anderson. (2000). *Forbearance: The Life Story of Thelma Vernell Anderson Gibson, a Coconut Grove Native*. Homestead, FL: Helena Enterprises, Incorporated.

Labbee, W. (1991). Black Grove feature. *Miami New Times*. Retrieved from <http://www.miaminewtimes.com/news/black-grove-feature-6365177>

Logan, T. (2016). City of Miami Preservation Office Historic Design Guidelines. Miami, FL: City of Miami Planning Department.

Macedonia Missionary Baptist Church, Inc. (2015). About Us. Retrieved from <http://www.macedoniambcmiami.com/about-the-church>

McAlester, V. S. & McAlester, L. (2002). *A field guide to American houses*. New York, NY: Knopf.

Merrick, G. E. (1941). Pre-Flagler influences on the lower Florida east coast. *Tequesta*, volume one, (number one). Retrieved from <http://dpanther.fiu.edu/dpService/dpPurlService/purl/FI08060901/00001>

Miccosukee Magazine. (2002) Episode 352. History of Coconut Grove by Dr. Paul George. Retrieved from <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=gIDPEYpA4UQ>

Mohl, R. A. (2009). Black immigrants: Bahamians in the early twentieth-century Miami. *Tequesta*, volume 1, (number 69). Retrieved from <http://dpanther.fiu.edu/dpService/dpPurlService/purl/FI18050900/00069>

The National Archives. (n.d.). Abolition of slavery. Retrieved from <http://www.nationalarchives.gov.uk/slavery/about.htm>

Nebhrajani, R. (2016, May 22.) Thelma Gibson looks back on 90 in West Grove. *The New Tropic*. Retrieved from <https://thenewtropic.com/thelma-gibson/>

Novaes, M. (2012) Report of the City of Miami Preservation Officer to the Historic and Environmental Preservation Board on the designation report of the Evangelist Street/Charles Avenue as a historic site. Miami, FL: City of Miami Planning Department.

Parks, Arva Moore. (2010). *Coconut Grove* (Images of America). Charleston, SC: Arcadia Pub.

Parks Moore, Arva. (2010). Mary Barr Munroe, 1852-1922: South Florida's pioneer zealot. In L. E. Rivers & C. Brown Jr. (Eds.), *The varieties of women's experiences: Portraits of southern women in the post-civil war century*. Gainesville, FL: University Press of Florida.

Uguccione, E. J. & Eaton, S. E. (2004) Report of the City of Miami Preservation Officer to the Historic and Environmental Preservation Board on the designation report of the E.W.F. Stirrup House as a historic site. Miami, FL: City of Miami Planning Department.

VII- Photographs

On file with the City of Miami Planning Department.

VIII- List of Properties

The following table has been superseded due to certain properties being deemed ineligible for designation by the Historic and Environmental Preservation Board and a number of appeals that were granted by the City Commission on October 11, 2018. Tables showing the ineligible properties, appealed properties, and designated properties can be found on the following pages.

FOLIO	ADDRESS	CITY	ZIP	ZONING	YEAR
0141210075420	3242 CHARLES AVE	Miami	33133-5802	T4-L	1930
0141210075411	3250 CHARLES AVE	Miami	33133-5802	T3-R	1932
0141210075130	3297 CHARLES AVE	Miami	33133-5801	T3-R	1939
0141210075130	3295 CHARLES AVE	Miami	33133-5801	T3-R	1939
0141210075370	3298 CHARLES AVE	Miami	33133-5802	T3-R	1932
0141210075100	3325 CHARLES AVE	Miami	33133-5803	T3-R	1936
0141210075270	3388 CHARLES AVE	Miami	33133-5804	T3-R	1936
0141210075260	3418 CHARLES AVE	Miami	33133-5806	T3-R	1930
0141210075250	3420 CHARLES AVE	Miami	33133-5806	T3-R	1930
0141210074310	3427 SW 37 AVE	Miami	33133-5705	T3-O	1925
0141210120641	3447 WILLIAM AVE	Miami	33133-5835	T3-R	1934
0141210074740	3475 HIBISCUS ST	Miami	33133-5717	T3-R	1937
0141210074740	3477 HIBISCUS ST	Miami	33133-5717	T3-R	1937
0141210076120	3508 HIBISCUS ST	Miami	33133-5720	T3-R	1911
0141210075170	3517 HIBISCUS ST	Miami	33133-5719	T3-R	1920
0141210076140	3536 WILLIAM AVE	Miami	33133-5729	T3-R	1929
0141210076240	3537 CHARLES AVE	Miami	33133-5713	T3-R	1930
0141210075490	3566 THOMAS AVE	Miami	33133-5735	T3-O	1937
0141210077120	3571 HIBISCUS ST	Miami	33133-5702	T3-R	1935
0141210077120	3571R HIBISCUS ST	Miami	33133-5702	T3-R	1935
0141210077120	3573 HIBISCUS ST	Miami	33133-5702	T3-R	1935
0141210076360	3588 CHARLES AVE	Miami	33133-5714	T3-R	1935
0141210076360	3586 CHARLES AVE	Miami	33133-5714	T3-R	1935
0141210076360	3541 PLAZA ST	Miami	33133-5725	T3-R	1935
0141210076360	3543 PLAZA ST	Miami	33133-5725	T3-R	1935
0141210077050	3587 HIBISCUS ST	Miami	33133-5702	T3-R	1935
0141210076380	3589 FRANKLIN AVE	Miami	33133-5715	T3-R	1934
0141210076380	3593 FRANKLIN AVE	Miami	33133-5715	T3-R	1934
0141210076110	3603 CHARLES AVE	Miami	33133-5703	T3-R	1928
0141210075650	3616 THOMAS AVE	Miami	33133-5710	T3-O	1923

0141210072380	3628 FROW AVE	Miami	33133-4920	T3-R	1914
0141210070950	3635 OAK AVE	Miami	33133-4907	T3-R	1925
0141210070950	3637 OAK AVE	Miami	33133-4907	T3-R	1925
0141210072410	3644 FROW AVE	Miami	33133-4920	T3-R	1928
0141210075700	3658 THOMAS AVE	Miami	33133-5710	T3-O	1936
0141210075760	3671 WILLIAM AVE	Miami	33133-5711	T3-R	1924
0141210075750	3673 WILLIAM AVE	Miami	33133-5711	T3-R	1928
0141210076000	3678 WILLIAM AVE	Miami	33133-5712	T3-R	1928
0141200070770	3727 THOMAS AVE	Miami	33133-5639	T3-O	1934
0141200060730	3738 OAK AVE	Miami	33133-4807	T3-R	1930
0141200070580	3746 WASHINGTON AVE	Miami	33133-5643	T3-O	1937
0141200070590	3748 WASHINGTON AVE	Miami	33133-5643	T3-O	1937
0141200060490	3758 FROW AVE	Miami	33133-4836	T3-R	1938
0141200060490	3760 FROW AVE	Miami	33133-4836	T3-R	1938
0141200060350	3769 FLORIDA AVE	Miami	33133-4864	T3-R	1940
0141200060450	3790 FROW AVE	Miami	33133-4836	T3-R	1930
0141200070050	3797 WASHINGTON AVE	Miami	33133-5642	T3-O	1932
0141200060680	3802 OAK AVE	Miami	33133-4809	T3-R	1932
0141200060670	3820 OAK AVE	Miami	33133-4809	T3-R	1932
0141200060850	3821 OAK AVE	Miami	33133-4808	T3-R	1937
0141200060660	3822 OAK AVE	Miami	33133-4809	T3-R	1941
0141200060660	3826 OAK AVE	Miami	33133-4809	T3-R	1941
0141200070680	3837 THOMAS AVE	Miami	33133-5640	T3-O	1935
0141200070680	3841 THOMAS AVE	Miami	33133-5640	T3-O	1935
0141200070210	3859 WASHINGTON AVE	Miami	33133-5644	T3-O	1934
0141200070230	3875 WASHINGTON AVE	Miami	33133-5644	T3-O	1935
0141200070330	3963 WASHINGTON AVE	Miami	33133-5646	T3-O	1930

The following property was declared an unsafe structure and demolished. It was not included in the Final Designation report submitted for review by the Historic and Environmental Preservation Board.

FOLIO	ADDRESS	CITY	ZIP	ZONING	YEAR
0141210076000	3678 WILLIAM AVE	Miami	33133-5712	T3-R	1928

The following properties were determined ineligible for historic designation by the Historic and Environmental Board at the meeting of July 16, 2018.

FOLIO	ADDRESS	CITY	ZIP	ZONING	YEAR
0141210075270	3388 CHARLES AVE	Miami	33133-5804	T3-R	1936
0141210074310	3427 SW 37 AVE	Miami	33133-5705	T3-O	1925
0141210120641	3447 WILLIAM AVE	Miami	33133-5835	T3-R	1934
0141210075700	3656 THOMAS AVE	Miami	33133-5710	T3-O	1936
0141210075700	3658 THOMAS AVE	Miami	33133-5710	T3-O	1936
0141200070580	3746 WASHINGTON AVE	Miami	33133-5643	T3-O	1937
0141200070230	3875 WASHINGTON AVE	Miami	33133-5644	T3-O	1935

Appeals were submitted for the following designated properties. The appeals were granted by the City Commission on October 11, 2018. Resolution numbers are included in the table.

FOLIO	ADDRESS	CITY	ZIP	ZONING	YEAR	RESOLUTION
0141210075130	3297 CHARLES AVE	Miami	33133	T3-R	1939	R-18-0452
0141210075130	3295 CHARLES AVE	Miami	33133	T3-R	1939	R-18-0452
0141210075260	3418 CHARLES AVE	Miami	33133	T3-R	1930	R-18-0456
0141210074740	3475 HIBISCUS ST	Miami	33133	T3-R	1937	R-18-0454
0141210074740	3477 HIBISCUS ST	Miami	33133	T3-R	1937	R-18-0454
0141210076120	3508 HIBISCUS ST	Miami	33133	T3-R	1911	R-18-0457
0141210076360	3588 CHARLES AVE	Miami	33133	T3-R	1935	R-18-0458
0141210076360	3586 CHARLES AVE	Miami	33133	T3-R	1935	R-18-0458
0141210076360	3541 PLAZA ST	Miami	33133	T3-R	1935	R-18-0458
0141210076360	3543 PLAZA ST	Miami	33133	T3-R	1935	R-18-0458
0141210077050	3587 HIBISCUS ST	Miami	33133	T3-R	1935	R-18-0459
0141210075650	3616 THOMAS AVE	Miami	33133	T3-O	1923	R-18-0453
0141210070950	3635 OAK AVE	Miami	33133	T3-R	1925	R-18-0464
0141210070950	3637 OAK AVE	Miami	33133	T3-R	1925	R-18-0464
0141210072410	3644 FROW AVE	Miami	33133	T3-R	1928	R-18-0462
0141210075760	3671 WILLIAM AVE	Miami	33133	T3-R	1924	R-18-0460
0141210075750	3673 WILLIAM AVE	Miami	33133	T3-R	1928	R-18-0461
0141200060490	3758 FROW AVE	Miami	33133	T3-R	1938	R-18-0455
0141200060490	3760 FROW AVE	Miami	33133	T3-R	1938	R-18-0455

0141200070680	3837 THOMAS AVE	Miami	33133	T3-O	1935	R-18-0463
0141200070680	3841 THOMAS AVE	Miami	33133	T3-O	1935	R-18-0463
0141200070210	3859 WASHINGTON AVE	Miami	33133	T3-O	1934	R-18-0465

The following table shows the final list of designated sites effective October 11, 2018.

FOLIO	ADDRESS	CITY	ZIP	ZONING	YEAR
0141210075420	3242 CHARLES AVE	Miami	33133-5802	T4-L	1930
0141210075411	3250 CHARLES AVE	Miami	33133-5802	T3-R	1932
0141210075370	3298 CHARLES AVE	Miami	33133-5802	T3-R	1932
0141210075100	3325 CHARLES AVE	Miami	33133-5803	T3-R	1936
0141210075250	3420 CHARLES AVE	Miami	33133-5806	T3-R	1930
0141210075170	3517 HIBISCUS ST	Miami	33133-5719	T3-R	1920
0141210076140	3536 WILLIAM AVE	Miami	33133-5729	T3-R	1929
0141210076240	3537 CHARLES AVE	Miami	33133-5713	T3-R	1930
0141210075490	3566 THOMAS AVE	Miami	33133-5735	T3-O	1937
0141210077120	3571 HISBISCUS ST	Miami	33133-5702	T3-R	1935
0141210077120	3571R HISBICUS ST	Miami	33133-5702	T3-R	1935
0141210077120	3573 HIBISCUS ST	Miami	33133-5702	T3-R	1935
0141210076380	3589 FRANKLIN AVE	Miami	33133-5715	T3-R	1934
0141210076380	3593 FRANKLIN AVE	Miami	33133-5715	T3-R	1934
0141210076110	3603 CHARLES AVE	Miami	33133-5703	T3-R	1928
0141210072380	3628 FROW AVE	Miami	33133-4920	T3-R	1914
0141200070770	3727 THOMAS AVE	Miami	33133-5639	T3-O	1934
0141200060730	3738 OAK AVE	Miami	33133-4807	T3-R	1930
0141200070590	3748 WASHINGTON AVE	Miami	33133-5643	T3-O	1937
0141200060350	3769 FLORIDA AVE	Miami	33133-4864	T3-R	1940
0141200060450	3790 FROW AVE	Miami	33133-4836	T3-R	1930
0141200070050	3797 WASHINGTON AVE	Miami	33133-5642	T3-O	1932
0141200060680	3802 OAK AVE	Miami	33133-4809	T3-R	1932
0141200060670	3820 OAK AVE	Miami	33133-4809	T3-R	1932
0141200060850	3821 OAK AVE	Miami	33133-4808	T3-R	1937
0141200060660	3822 OAK AVE	Miami	33133-4809	T3-R	1941
0141200060660	3826 OAK AVE	Miami	33133-4809	T3-R	1941
0141200070330	3963 WASHINGTON AVE	Miami	33133-5646	T3-O	1930
0141210075700	3660 THOMAS AVE	Miami	33133-5710	T3-O	1936
0141210075700	3662 THOMAS AVE	Miami	33133-5710	T3-O	1936